

County of Hawai'i

PLANNING COMMISSION

Aupuni Center • 101 Pauahi Street, Suite 3 • Hilo, Hawai'i 96720 Phone (808) 961-8288 • Fax (808) 961-8742

October 4, 2006

Garvin & Laura Goode P.O. Box 552 Papaikou, HI 96781

Dear Mr. and Mrs. Goode:

Special Permit Application (SPP 06-000031) Applicant: Garvin & Laura Goode Trust

Request: Construct a Building for Operating a Fruit & Produce Stand & Also

For Preparation of Cold Foods
Tax Map Key: 2-7-8:portion 130

Enclosed is the Planning Commission's Findings of Fact, Conclusions of Law and Decision and Order regarding the above-referenced application which was denied by the Commission on September 7, 2006.

Sincerely,

C. Kimo Alameda, Chairman

Planning Commission

Lgoode01pc Enclosure

cc/enc: Ms. Lori Mikkelson

Department of Public Works Department of Water Supply

Ivan Torigoe, Esq.

State Land Use Commission

PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE COUNTY OF HAWAI'I

STATE OF HAWAI'I

Application of	SP 06-0000031
GARVIN AND LAURA GOODE TRUST,	FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW AND DECISION AND ORDER
Special Permit to allow the construction of a 1,584± square foot (44 feet x 36 feet) building for the sale of fruits/produce, including a certified kitchen for preparation of cold foods, on 1 acre of land situated within the State Land Use Agricultural District. The area involved is located at the northwest corner of State Highway 19 and Kalaoa Camp Road, adjacent to and south of Aukuu Stream, Kalaoa, South Hilo, Hawai'i, TMK: 2-7-8: portion of 130.	

FINDINGS OF FACT, CONCLUSIONS OF LAW, DECISION AND ORDER. Background

GARVIN AND LAURA GOODE TRUST (hereinafter, "Applicant") applied for a Special Permit to allow the construction of a 1,584± square foot (44 feet x 36 feet) building for the sale of fruits/produce and nursery stock, including a certified kitchen for the preparation of cold foods (sandwiches, smoothies, and cold drinks), on 1 acre of land situated within the State Land Use Agricultural District. The area involved is located at the northwest corner of State Highway 19 and Kalaoa Camp Road, adjacent to and south of Aukuu Stream, Kalaoa, South Hilo, Hawai'i, TMK: 2-7-8: portion of 130.

The County of Hawai'i Planning Commission (hereinafter, "Planning Commission") reviewed evidence and heard testimony from Applicant's representative, Lori Mikkelson, dba All Aina Services, at hearings held on September 7, 2006 at the County of

Hawai'i Aupuni Center Conference Room, 101 Pauahi Street, Hilo, Hawai'i. The Planning Director was also a party to the hearings pursuant to Planning Commission Rules of Practice and Procedure (hereinafter "Commission Rule") 4-7(a). All Commissioners voting on the instant Special Permit have either attended all hearings and/or reviewed the entire record and files herein.

The Commission, having considered the entire record, and having heard and considered the arguments of the parties, makes the following findings of fact, conclusions of law, and order.

FINDINGS OF FACT

1. GARVIN AND LAURA GOODE TRUST (hereinafter, "Applicant") applied for a Special Permit to allow the construction of a 1,584± square foot (44 feet x 36 feet) building for the sale of fruits/produce, including a certified kitchen for the preparation of cold foods (sandwiches, smoothies, and cold drinks), on 1 acre of land situated within the State Land Use Agricultural District. The area involved is located at the northwest corner of State Highway 19 and Kalaoa Camp Road, adjacent to and south of Aukuu Stream, Kalaoa, South Hilo, Hawai'i, TMK: 2-7-8: portion of 130.

APPLICANT'S REQUEST

- 2. Proposed Request: The applicant, Garvin and Laura Goode Trust, applied for a Special Permit to establish a 1,584± square foot (44 feet x 36 feet) building for the sale of fruits/produce, including a certified kitchen for the preparation of cold foods (sandwiches, smoothies, and cold drinks) on a 1-acre portion of a 7.4-acre property. The building would include the following:
 - Fruit/produce stand, in which items that are grown on the property will be sold

such as bananas, papayas, pineapples, citrus, avocados, and an assortment of vegetables. The applicant is also proposing to offer produce from other farms. Additionally, the applicant is proposing to sell nursery stock; and

- Certified kitchen for the preparation of cold foods such as sandwiches, smoothies,
 and cold drinks; and
- Restroom facilities, product display area, and a customer seating area within the proposed building. There will be ample space for parking.

Employees: The business would be operated mainly by family members, but additional employees may be hired to include two full-time employees.

Hours of Operation: Proposed hours are from 10:00 a.m. to 5: p.m., 7 days a week.

Number of Customers Expected: Approximately 30 to 40 customers per day.

(Planning Department's Background Report Exhibit 1 – Application for Special Permit)

STATE AND COUNTY PLANS

- 3. State Land Use District: Agricultural.
- 4. General Plan LUPAG Map: Low Density Urban and Important Agricultural Lands. The proposed request is located in the area designated as Low Density Urban.
 - 5. County Zoning: Agricultural 20-acre (A-20a).
- 6. Coastal Zone Management, HRS Chapter 205A: The entire State of Hawai'i lies within the Coastal Zone Management area. The intent of the Coastal Zone Management Program is to guide and regulate public and private uses in the coastal zone management area with respect to recreational resources, historic resources, public access to the shoreline, scenic and open space resources, coastal ecosystems, marine resources, economic uses, coastal hazards, managing development, public participation, and beach protection.

7. Special Management Area (SMA): The Special Management Area is a part of the Coastal Zone Management Program and regulated by the County. The property is not located within the SMA and is approximately one half mile from the nearest coastline.

DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY AND SURROUNDING AREA

- 8. Subject Property: The subject property is approximately 7.4 acres in size. There is a newly constructed 5-bedroom/5-bathroom dwelling located on the upper mauka portion of the property. The property is situated along the Hawai'i Belt Road between the 7 and 8-mile markers. Kalaoa Camp Road, an easement over private property, runs through the property. The northern boundary of the property runs along the middle of Aukuu Stream.
- 9. Building Permits: According to Building Records, the following building permits have been issued for this property:
 - 5-Bedroom/5-Bath Dwelling: Building Permit No. 031817 was issued to Garvin Goode on September 5, 2003 for a dwelling. The permit was finaled on September 21, 2004.
 - Addition of Covered Entry and Lanai: Building Permit No. B2004-0605H was issued to Garvin and Laura Goode Trust on March 25, 2004 for a covered entry and lanai addition to the dwelling. The permit was finaled on September 21, 2004.
 - Solar Water Heater with Panels: Building Permit No. B2004-0800H was issued to Garvin Goode on May 5, 2004 for the installation of a solar water heater with panels on roof. The permit was finaled on September 24, 2004
- 10. Surrounding Zoning/Land Uses: Surrounding properties are zoned A-20a and RS-10, and consist of vacant land, single-family dwellings and agricultural uses.

Within this particular section of the South Hilo District, commercial development has been established in Pāpa'ikou, less than one mile south of the site, and Pepe'ekeo, a distance of approximately 2½ miles north of the project site. These locations have commercial zoned areas that allow uses similar to those being proposed by the applicant for this area.

Approval of this request located between two separate established commercial zoned areas may attract the "in-filling" of lands between these areas with other commercial developments. Such strip development would create rapid growth increase in adverse impacts to traffic as multiple access points would be required for such developments. The proposed development alone would create another traffic generator along the Hawai'i Belt Road, which is already a congested highway. Concentration of commercial and related uses in the areas identified in the General Plan for commercial development, would ease the need for further roadway improvements in the area to accommodate such commercial uses.

- 11. U.S. Soil Survey: Hilo silty clay loam, 10 to 20 percent slopes (HoD). Runoff is medium, and the erosion hazard is slight to moderate.
 - 12. Land Study Bureau Soil Rating: "C"or "Fair".
 - 13. ALISH: "Prime Agricultural Land".

The land on which the proposed use is located is classified as Prime Agricultural Land by the Agricultural Lands of Importance to the State of Hawai'i (ALISH) Map. Prime Agricultural Land is land best suited for the production of food, feed, forage and fiber crops. The land has the soil quality, growing season and moisture supply needed to produce sustained high yields of crops economically when treated and managed, including water management, according to modern farming methods.

The approval to allow a commercial facility on this property would result in converting

land identified as Prime Agricultural Land to an irreversible non-agricultural use and go against the State Land Use Law and Regulations, which are intended to preserve, protect and encourage the development of these lands for uses to which they are best suited. Although the applicant proposes to sell fruit and vegetable crops grown on-site with the proposed fruit/food stand, these crops have only recently been planted and will take some time to generate sellable produce. Applicant is also asking to sell cold foods prepared in an onsite certified commercial kitchen, as well as produce from other sites and nursery stock.

The foregoing would be a fairly intensive commercial retail use permanently occupying, with its "ample parking" up to an acre of prime agricultural land.

Based on the above, the proposed use of a commercial type facility at this particular location would not be best suited for this area of South Hilo because similar uses have been established in Pāpa'ikou and Pepe'ekeo, which are located in areas that are identified for commercial uses in the General Plan.

- 14. FIRM: Zone "X", areas determined to be outside the 500-year flood plain.
- 15. Flora and Fauna Resources: No professional flora or faunal surveys were conducted, as the property was previously cleared and developed with a dwelling and is being utilized for agricultural uses. According to the applicant, on the north border of the parcel there is a mixture of tropical and native forest within the Aukuu Stream, which will be maintained. Fauna resources observed in the area include many tropical birds, such as the wandering tattler, golden plover and the pueo.
- 16. Archaeological/Historical Resources: No commissioned archaeological inventory survey of the area was conducted. In a letter dated October 25, 2005, the applicant requested a "no effect" letter from the State Department of Land and Natural Resources Historic Preservation

Division. There has been no response as of the date of this writing.

- 17. Cultural Resources: According to the applicant, there is no evidence of any traditional native Hawaiian activities on the property.
- 18. Public Access: There is no public access to the mountains or the shoreline that traverses the property.
- 19. Traffic: According to the applicant, there would be a minimal impact on traffic. The applicant expects that most of the clientele would consist of people commuting to and from Hilo along the Hāmākua Coast. Applicant anticipates that this would not increase the amount of traffic traveling along Hawai'i Belt Road in this area, but may cause additional turns on and off the highway. The applicant is proposing efforts to reduce any traffic impacts, such as limiting the hours of operation to close the facility during peak traffic times. Ample parking will be provided on-site.

There is an access easement called Kalaoa Camp Road that runs through the property to provide access mainly to parcels located on the mauka side of the subject property. The proposed commercial retail development will also use this road for access. There will be a significant increase of traffic along Kalaoa Camp Road generated by the proposed development, which will unreasonably burden the surrounding property owners that utilize this road for access to and from their properties. There will also be increased amounts of vehicles turning left from the highway onto Kalaoa Camp Road, causing increased delays to people traveling along the Hawai'i Belt Road.

The proposed use places a burden on public agencies to provide safe ingress and egress onto the Hawai'i Belt Road. Access to the project site is from the Hawai'i Belt Road between the 7 and 8-mile markers onto Kalaoa Camp Road. This is a State Highway that has a 22-foot

paved roadway with paved shoulders within a 100-foot wide right-of-way. The location of the access is on a sloped portion of the highway with a posted speed limit of 45 mph in both directions.

The Department of Transportation commented that the applicant should consult with their Highways Division to go over the proposed construction plans. Access on and from the highway and drainage from the site would be some of the items that will need to be reviewed. The project plans will be subject to conditions and/or correction as determined by the State Highways Hawai'i District Office.

Safety is a priority when considering any permit application. This application places people traveling on the Hawai'i Belt Road at risk given the sloped conditions and speed limit for this area. This will also place an unreasonable burden on public agencies such as police and fire, who will have to respond to accidents that may occur as a result of unsafe conditions.

Additionally, this area is made up of larger agricultural lots with scattered dwellings. The development of a 1,584± square foot commercial facility within this agricultural area will adversely affect the surrounding property owners by increasing traffic and noise in the area.

PUBLIC SERVICES AND FACILITIES

- 20. Access: Access to the project site is from the Hawai'i Belt Road (Highway 19), a State-owned and maintained road with a 22-foot pavement and paved shoulders within an 100-foot right-of-way onto Kalaoa Camp Road, which has a 13-foot gravel road within a 30-foot access easement over private property.
 - 21. Water: County water is available to the site.
- 22. Wastewater: Although the applicant is proposing to utilize a new cesspool, they would be required to comply with the Department of Health's rules and regulations regarding

individual wastewater systems in effect at the time of building permit application, either a cesspool system or a septic system.

23. Essential Utilities and Services: Telephone and electrical services are available to the site. Police, fire and medical services are available in Hilo Town, approximately 8 miles from the subject property.

AGENCIES' COMMENTS

24. Police Department (June 28, 2006 Memo):

Without analysis or further comment, stated: "Staff, upon reviewing the provided documents and visiting the proposed site, does not anticipate any significant impact to traffic and/or public safety concerns."

25. Department of Health (June 27, 2006 Memo):

"The use of individual wastewater systems is allowed. The type and number of individual wastewater systems to be used will be determined by the wastewater rules in effect at the time of building permit application. The proposed kitchen facility and lunch wagon operation would need to meet the requirements of Chapter 12, Food Establishment Sanitation."

26. Department of Transportation (July 22, 2006 Letter):

"Thank you for requesting our review of the subject application on a project for the construction of improvements for a fruit and produce stand, including preparation of cold foods. The applicant should consult with our Highways Division to go over the proposed construction plans. Access on and from the highway and drainage from the site will be some of the items that will need to be reviewed. The project plans will be subject to conditions and/or correction as determined by the Highways Hawaii District Office."

- 27. Department of Public Works: (Planning Department Exhibit 2 July 14, 2006 Memo)
- 28. Department of Water Supply: (Planning Department Exhibit 3 July 18, 2006 Memo)
- 29. Department of Environmental Management: (Planning Department Exhibit 4 June 21, 2006 Memo)
 - 30. Fire Department: (Planning Department Exhibit 5 July 7, 2006, Memo)
- 31. State Land Use Commission: (Planning Department Exhibit 6 July 7, 2006 Letter). The LUC confirmed that the subject property is in the state land use Agricultural District. "Given the location, scope, and nature of the proposed activity, the State Land Use Commission defers to the judgment of the County of Hawai'i regarding other matters in the application. We have no further comments to offer at this time."

AGENCIES - NO RESPONSE

32. Department of Land and Natural Resources-Land Division and Historic Preservation Division, and Natural Resources Conservation Service.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

33. Planning Department had not received any written objections or comments from the general public or adjacent landowners on the subject application.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

Based upon the foregoing Findings of Fact, the Commission makes the following Conclusions of Law, including mixed conclusions of fact and law.

1. The Commission has jurisdiction over this Special Permit application pursuant to Hawai'i Revised Statutes (hereinafter, "HRS") Section 205-6.

- 2. Pursuant to HRS Section 205-6, and Planning Commission Rule 6.6., the Commission shall not approve a Special Permit unless it is found that the proposed use:
 - a. Is an unusual and reasonable use of land situated within the Agricultural or Rural District, whichever the case may be; and
 - b. Would promote the effectiveness and objectives of Chapter 205, Hawai'i Revised Statutes, as amended.
- 3. In considering the Special Permit application, the Commission shall also consider the criteria listed under Commission Rules Section 6.3(b)(5)(A) through (G), which are:
 - a. Such use shall not be contrary to the objectives sought to be accomplished by the Land Use Law and Regulations;
 - b. The desired use shall not adversely affect surrounding properties;
 - c. Such use shall not unreasonably burden public agencies to provide roads and streets, sewers, water, drainage, school improvements, and police and fire protection;
 - d. Unusual conditions, trends, and needs have arisen since the district boundaries and regulations were established;
 - e. The land upon which the proposed use is sought is unsuited for the uses permitted within the district;
 - f. The proposed use will not substantially alter or change the essential character of the land and the present use; and
 - g. The request will not be contrary to the General Plan and official Community Development Plan and other documents such as Design Plans.
- 4. The Planning Director shall advise the Planning Commission on all planning and land use matters, pursuant to Hawai'i County Charter Section 6-4.2(a). The Planning Director recommended denial of the instant Special Permit application. The Planning Commission majority agreed with the Planning Director's recommendation, and incorporates herein the

Planning Director's reasoning, as stated in the following findings of fact, and mixed findings of fact and conclusions of law.

- 5. The proposed use is not a reasonable use of land situated within the Agricultural District. Although the proposed request is an unusual use of land, it is not reasonable because of the non-compliance with the long range plan for this area, and because of the traffic and safety issues associated with a commercial development established along the highway without proper infrastructure, as further explained in the following.
- 6. The proposed use would not promote the effectiveness and objectives of Chapter 205, HRS, as amended. The proposed use would not promote the effectiveness and objectives of Chapter 205, HRS, as amended. The State Land Use Law and Regulations are intended to preserve, protect and encourage the development of lands in the State for those uses to which they are best suited in the interest of the public health and welfare of the people of the State of Hawai'i. In the case of the Agricultural District, the intent is to preserve or keep lands of high agricultural potential in agricultural use.
- The land on which the proposed use is located is classified as Prime Agricultural Land by the Agricultural Lands of Importance to the State of Hawai'i (ALISH) Map. Prime Agricultural Land is land best suited for the production of food, feed, forage and fiber crops. The land has the soil quality, growing season and moisture supply needed to produce sustained high yields of crops economically when treated and managed, including water management, according to modern farming methods. The approval to allow a commercial facility on this property would result in converting land identified as Prime Agricultural Land to an irreversible non-agricultural use and go against the State Land Use Law and Regulations, which are intended to preserve, protect and encourage the development these lands for uses to which they are best

suited. Although the applicant proposes to sell fruit and vegetable crops grown on-site with the proposed fruit/food stand, these crops have only recently been planted and will take some time to generate sellable produce. Applicant is also asking to sell cold foods prepared in an onsite certified commercial kitchen, as well as produce from other sites and nursery stock.

The foregoing would be a fairly intensive commercial retail use permanently occupying, with its "ample parking" up to an acre of prime agricultural land.

- 8. Based on the above, the proposed use of a commercial type facility at this particular location would not be best suited for this area of South Hilo because similar uses have been established in Pāpa'ikou and Pepe'ekeo, which are located in areas that are identified for commercial uses in the General Plan.
- 9. In addition to the above listed criteria, the Planning Commission shall also consider the criteria listed under Section 6-3(b)(5) (A) through (G). In considering the criteria, the Planning Commission concludes as follows:
 - (A) Such use shall not be contrary to the objectives sought to be accomplished by the Land Use Law and Regulations. This criterion is not met based on the previous discussion listed above, mainly that the State Land Use Law and Regulations are intended to preserve, protect and encourage the development of lands in the State for those uses to which they are best suited in the interest of the public health and welfare of the people of the State of Hawai'i. The project site is classified as Prime Agricultural Land and should be preserved for agricultural activities. In addition, this use would be better located within a commercial zoned area within Pāpa'ikou or Pepe'ekeo.

There is an access easement called Kalaoa Camp Road that runs through the property to provide access mainly to parcels located on the mauka side of the subject property. The proposed development will also use this road for access. There will be a significant increase of traffic along Kalaoa Camp Road generated by the proposed development, which will unreasonably burden the surrounding property owners that utilize this road for access to and from their properties. There will also be increased amounts of vehicles turning left from the highway onto Kalaoa Camp Road, causing increased delays to people traveling along the Hawaii Belt Road.

Additionally, this area is made up of larger agricultural lots with scattered dwellings. The development of a 1,584± square foot commercial facility within this agricultural area will adversely affect the surrounding property owners by increasing traffic and noise in the area. Based on the above, this criterion has not been met.

(C) Such use shall not unreasonably burden public agencies to provide roads and streets, sewers, water, drainage, school improvements, and police and fire protection. The proposed use places a burden on public agencies to provide safe ingress and egress onto the Hawaii Belt Road. Access to the project site is from the Hawaii Belt Road between the 7 and 8-mile markers onto Kalaoa Camp Road. This is a State Highway that has a 22-

foot paved roadway with paved shoulders within a 100-foot wide right-of-way. The location of the access is on a sloped portion of the highway with a posted speed limit of 45 mph in both directions.

The Department of Transportation commented that the applicant should consult with their Highways Division to go over the proposed construction plans. Access on and from the highway and drainage from the site would be some of the items that will need to be reviewed. The project plans will be subject to conditions and/or correction as determined by their Highways Hawaii District Office.

Safety is a priority when recommending an approval for any permit application. This request places people traveling on the Hawaii Belt Road at risk given the sloped conditions and speed limit for this area. This will also place an unreasonable burden on public agencies such as police and fire, who will have to respond to accidents that may occur as a result of unsafe conditions. Based on the above, this criterion has not been met.

- (D) Unusual conditions, trends, and needs have arisen since district boundaries and regulations were established. This criterion has not been met because there are alternatives available for this type of use in Pāpa'ikou and Pepe'ekeo. This location is not an area that should be considered as an alternative to establish a long-term commercial operation.
- (E) The land upon which the proposed use is sought is unsuited for the uses permitted within the district. This criterion is not met. The land on which the proposed use is located is classified as Prime Agricultural Land by the

- Agricultural Lands of Importance to the State of Hawai'i (ALISH) Map and "C" or "Fair" soil according to the Land Study Bureau Soil Rating classification. The property is suitable for the production of food, feed, forage and fiber crops.
- (F) The proposed use will not substantially alter or change the essential character of the land and present use. This criterion is partially met, in that only a portion of the land would be used for the proposed development. The remainder of the property will be for residential and agricultural uses. However, the 1-acre portion of the property would be substantially changed to commercial retail uses.
- Community Development Plan and other documents such as Design Plans.

 This criterion has not been met. The project site is located in area identified as "Low Density Urban" in the General Plan. This designation mainly allows for residential uses, with an overall residential density of up to six units per acre. It can also allow ancillary community and public uses, and neighborhood and convenience-type commercial uses.

 A goal of the General Plan states that the County shall "Designate and allocate land uses in appropriate proportions and mix and in keeping with the social, cultural, and physical environments" while maintaining a policy to "... encourage the development and maintenance of communities meeting the needs of its residents in balance with the physical and social environment."

Within this particular section of the South Hilo District, commercial development has been established in Papaikou, less than one mile south of the site, and Pepeekeo, a distance of approximately 2½ miles north of the project site. These locations have commercial zoned areas that allow similar uses being proposed by the applicant for this area.

- 10. The proposed request also fails to address the fundamental problems associated with the development of a commercial development in this particular area, which is the inability to establish an effective land use pattern. Effective land use planning requires a regional perspective towards establishing a proper land use pattern within a given area. As mentioned previously, commercial zoning has been established in Pāpa'ikou and Pepe'ekeo. Until such time regional infrastructure is able to accommodate widespread urban level of development in this area, it would not be prudent to sanction the spread of such traffic-generating uses in a manner which would frustrate the government's efforts to control the amount of impacts such uses will create.
- development should the request be approved. Approval of this request located between two separate established commercial zoned areas may attract the "in-filling" of lands between these areas with other commercial developments. Such strip development would create rapid growth increase in adverse impacts to traffic as multiple access points would be required for such developments. The proposed development alone would create another traffic generator along the Hawai'i Belt Road, which is already a congested highway. Concentration of commercial and

related uses in the areas identified in the General Plan for commercial development, would ease

the need for further roadway improvements in the area to accommodate these commercial uses.

12. Although the request is arguably related to the concept of a permissible roadside

stand for the selling of agricultural products, it does not meet the criteria for granting a Special

Permit. The overall impact of the facility will be as a commercial development located along a

major highway. The denial is based on several negative factors as stated above, in summary: 1)

that the request is not consistent with the long-range plan for commercial development for this

area and 2) that the establishment of a commercial facility along Hawai'i Belt Road will create

unnecessary traffic impacts and safety concerns.

DECISION AND ORDER

Based on the foregoing Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, Application SPP No.

06-000031 for a Special Permit to allow the construction and operation of a 1,584+ square foot

(44 feet x 36 feet) building for the sale of fruits/produce, and nursery stock, including a certified

kitchen for the preparation of cold foods (sandwiches, smoothies, and cold drinks), on 1 acre of

land situated within the State Land Use Agricultural District is hereby DENIED.

DATED: Hilo, Hawaii, October 4 , 2006.

Planning Commission

-18-